1	KEITH D. KARNES, OSB No. 033521 keith@rankkarneslaw.com		
2	KEVIN J. RANK, OSB No. 914034		
3	kevin@rankkarneslaw.com Rank & Karnes Law, PC		
4	2701 12 th St. SE		
5	Salem OR 97302 Tel: 503-385-8888		
6	Fax: 503-385-8899		
7	BRADY MERTZ, OSB No. 970814		
8	brady@bradymertz.com		
9	Brady Mertz PC 345 Lincoln St SE		
10	Salem OR 97302		
11	Tel: 503-385-0121 Fax: 503-375-2218		
12	RICK KLINGBEIL, OSB No. 933326		
13	rick@klingbeil-law.com		
14	Rick Klingbeil PC 1826 NE Broadway		
15	Portland OR 97232		
16	Tel: 503-473-8565		
17			
18	UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF OREGON		
19			
20			
21		Case No. 19-60230-pcm11	
22	In re:	REPLY TO DEBTOR WILLIAM J.	
23	WILLIAM JOHN BERMAN,	BERMAN'S RESPONSE TO AD HOC	
24	Debtor-in-possession,	GROUP'S MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION	
25			
26	The Hathaway Claimants hereby respon	d to Debtor's response to the Motion for Class	
27	Certification.		
28	pg. 1 REPLY TO DEBTOR WILLIAM J. BERN MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION	MAN'S RESPONSE TO AD HOC GROUP'S	
		Rank & Karnes Law, P.C. 2701 12th Street SE	
		Salem, OR 97302 Telephone (503) 385-8888 Facsimile (503) 385-8899	

Case 19-60230-pcm11 Doc 114 Filed 05/01/20

pg. 2 REPLY TO DEBTOR WILLIAM J. BERMAN'S RESPONSE TO AD HOC GROUP'S MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION

Rank & Karnes Law, P.C. 2701 12th Street SE Salem, OR 97302 Telephone (503) 385-8888 Facsimile (503) 385-8899

THE HATHAWAY CLAIMANTS HAVE

FILED A MOTION UNDER RULE 9014

Debtor objects to class certification due to Claimant's failure to file a motion under Rule 9014. Claimants have since filed a motion under Rule 9014 and outlined why the Court should apply Rule 7023.

Claimant's have sought class certification for 1) to prosecute and defend the proof of claim and 2) objecting to the claim of Saalfeld Griggs. The Saalfeld Griggs claim objection is no longer pending. Therefore, Claimants are seeking class certification for purposes related to only their proof of claim. Debtor has stipulated to granting relief from the automatic stay to allow the Circuit Court to allow the Claimants to obtain a supplemental judgment for attorney fees.

Therefore, Debtor's argument that Claimants are seeking to certify a class for multiple claims or multiple undefined matters is not a correct statement of what Claimants are seeking.

It is generally accepted that a Rule 9014 seeking to apply 7023 is filed separately from a Rule seeking certification under 7023. "In a contested matter, the party seeking to rely on Rule 23 must file a motion under Rule 9014." *In re Dynegy, Inc.*, 770 F.3d 1064, 1069 (2nd Cir. 2014).

Here, the Claimants have filed their motions under Rules 7023 and 9014 seeking class certification for their proof of claim. Therefore, Claimants have complied with the procedure. Rule 9014(c) on its face does not state that a motion needs to be filed if a party wishes to apply one of the non-enumerated rules of Part VII of the Bankruptcy Rules.

), | | / / /

15

17

19

20

21 22

23

25

24

26 27

28

This Court sits as a court of equity to accomplish the purposes of the Bankruptcy Code. See Gentry v. Siegel, 668 F.3d 83, 93 (4th Cir. 2012) citing: Katchen v. Landy, 382 U.S. 323, 327, 86 S.Ct. 467, 15 L.Ed.2d 391 (1966) Montgomery Ward & Co. v. Langer, 168 F.2d 182, 187 (8th Cir.1948).

Here, the Debtor has a confirmed plan. Prior to confirmation and during confirmation the Claimants made objections and introduced evidence. Debtor made no objection to the class status of the Claimants. Further, the Plan provides for payment of the Claimants Claims without any objection to Claimant's status. Debtor has objected to Claimant's Claim and Rule 9014 applies; therefore, Claimants are now seeking to have the Court use its equitable powers to allow the Claimants to have the Claim allowed on a class basis. The need to use this equitable power is particularly important here when there is ongoing litigation between the parties.

The Circuit Court has ongoing duties to class members to ensure that any distribution is fair and equitable and to oversee the compensation of the attorneys for the class. Since this process is ongoing, allowing class certification of the proof of claim would help effectuate and provide comity to the Circuit Court's duties.

TO THE EXTENT DEBTOR IS PREJUDICED, CLAIMANTS DO NOT OBJECT TO SUBSEQUENT BRIEFING

Debtor states that he does not believe Rule 23 has been satisfied. However, the Oregon rule for class certification is nearly identical to the Federal rule for class certification. Since the Circuit Court has already ruled that Claimants have met the requirements for class certification for their claims against Debtor it is doubtful that there is merit to this argument. However, to the

pg. 3 REPLY TO DEBTOR WILLIAM J. BERMAN'S RESPONSE TO AD HOC GROUP'S MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION

> Rank & Karnes Law, P.C. 2701 12th Street SE Salem, OR 97302 Telephone (503) 385-8888 Facsimile (503) 385-8899

extent Debtor has been prejudiced by Claimant's filing of a Rule 23 motion prior to the Rule 2019 motion, Claimants do not object to any additional briefing needed by the Debtor. Dated: May 1, 2020. /s/ Keith D. Karnes Keith D. Karnes OSB # 033521 **Attorney for Hathaway Claimants** pg. 4 REPLY TO DEBTOR WILLIAM J. BERMAN'S RESPONSE TO AD HOC GROUP'S MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION Rank & Karnes Law, P.C.

Case 19-60230-pcm11 Doc 114 Filed 05/01/20

2701 12th Street SE Salem, OR 97302 Telephone (503) 385-8888 Facsimile (503) 385-8899

1	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE		
2	I, Keith Karnes, certify that I served the forgoing document via ECF which will in turn serve:		
3			
4	TIMOTHY J CONWAY tim.conway@tonkon.com, candace.duncan@tonkon.com;spencer.fisher@tonkon.com;leslie.hurd@tonkon.com		
5	NICHOLAS J HENDERSON nhenderson@portlaw.com,		
6	tsexton@portlaw.com;mperry@portlaw.com;hendersonnr86571@notify.bestcase.com		
	KEITH D KARNES keith@rankkarneslaw.com, patricia@rankkarneslaw.com;9982680420@filings.docketbird.com;KarnesKR42869@notify.bes		
7	tcase.com		
8	SHANNON R MARTINEZ smartinez@sglaw.com, scurtis@sglaw.com		
9	ERICH M PAETSCH epaetsch@sglaw.com, ktate@sglaw.com TERESA H PEARSON teresa.pearson@millernash.com, MNGD-2823@millernash.com		
10	AVA L SCHOEN ava.schoen@tonkon.com,		
10	leslie.hurd@tonkon.com;spencer.fisher@tonkon.com		
11	TROY SEXTON tsexton@portlaw.com, nhenderson@portlaw.com,mperry@portlaw.com,troy-sexton-4772@ecf.pacerpro.com		
12	TOBIAS TINGLEAF toby@shermlaw.com, michael@shermlaw.com		
13	US Trustee, Eugene USTPRegion18.EG.ECF@usdoj.gov		
14	And I further served the following via first class mail, postage prepaid, addressed to:		
15	Hunter Emerick	Stephen Joye	
16	Saalfeld Griggs PC	Fischer, Hayes, Joye & Allen, LLC	
	250 Church St SE #200	3295 Triangle Dr #200	
17	Salem, OR 97301	Salem, OR 97302	
18	Janet M Schroer	Susan Stoehr	
19	1000 SW Broadway #2000	24310 S Hwy 99E, Space G	
20	Portland, OR 97205	Canby, OR 97013	
20	Ronald C. Williams	Nancy Wolf	
21	11612 SE Division St #8	2008 SE Sturdevant Rd	
22	Portland, OR 97266	Toledo, OR 97391	
23			
24	DATED: May 1, 2020		
25			
26		/s/Keith D. Karnes	
		Keith D. Karnes, OSB No. 033521	
27	Rank & Karnes Law, P.C.		
28	pg. 5 REPLY TO DEBTOR WILLIAM J. BERMAN'S RESPONSE TO AD HOC GROUP'S MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION		
	LIGHTON CLASS CLINITICATION	Rank & Karnes Law, P.C.	
		2701 12th Street SE Salem, OR 97302	
		Telephone (503) 385-8888 Facsimile (503) 385-8899	
	l .	1 aconinic (303) 303 0077	

Case 19-60230-pcm11 Doc 114 Filed 05/01/20